

City of Santa Barbara SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD

MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 29, 2018

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Fred Sweeney, Chair Brian Miller, Vice Chair Jan Ferrell Lisa James Joseph Moticha Robert Richards Jonathan H. Ziegler

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Addison Thompson

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor Katie Mamulski, Planning Technician Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Ferrell, and Ziegler

Members absent: James, Moticha, and Richards

Staff present: Mamulski and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **May 14, 2018**,

as submitted.

Action: Ferrell/Ziegler, 4/0/0. (Miller abstained. James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion

carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 21, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members

Sweeney and Richards.

Action: Ferrell/Ziegler, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 29, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members

Sweeney and Richards.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
 - 1. Ms. Mamulski announced the following:
 - a. Board members James, Moticha, and Richards will be absent from the meeting.
 - b. A new project at 2736 El Prado Road was originally noticed for today's meeting and has been postponed indefinitely for rescheduling and re-noticing.
 - c. Explained the "super-majority vote" requirement, minimum 5-Board member vote, for a pending floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) modification project which, due to the size of the lot, requires a super-majority vote before the project can continued for review at Planning Commission. An early quorum count of available Board members will be confirmed by staff prior to the tentative June 25, 2018, meeting.
- E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

1. 1202 DIANA RD RS-6 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-008

Application Number: MST2017-00217
Owner: BLH Properties LLC

Applicant: Shaun Lynch

Contractor: Vernon Construction

(The project consists of a proposal to subdivide an existing 1.06 acre parcel into four (4) lots in the RS-6, Single Residential Zone and Low Density Residential (Max 5 Dwelling Units/Acre) General Plan designation. The proposed lots vary in size from 9,000 to 15,566 square feet. The proposal includes development of one new primary dwelling unit on three of the four proposed lots (1, 2, and 4), subject to review by the Single Family Design Board (SFDB). The proposed new residential units range in size from 2,161 to 2,694 square feet, including an attached twocar garage, and range from 54 to 78% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Proposed lot 3 includes an existing one-story residential adobe, which is deemed eligible to be designated a historic resource by the City Urban Historian, and subject to review by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC). The application includes demolition of the "as-built" nonpermitted additions, resulting in the original 975 square foot adobe residence to remain. A new two-car garage is proposed at the rear of the existing adobe. Lot 3 development includes a proposed total of 1,375 square feet, located on the 12,648 square foot lot, and is 34% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Site improvements for the subdivision include demolition of the existing detached garage and detached accessory buildings, site grading (990 cubic yards of cut and 540 cubic yards of fill), removal, relocation, and replacement of Oak trees, and paving to create a new shared driveway easement connecting the proposed four lots to Cota Street. The existing driveway to Diana Road will remain. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map (TSM) and includes a request for Street Frontage Modifications and Public Street Waiver. The application will address all violations identified in ENF2017-00868.)

(Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map and includes a request for a Public Street Waiver and Street Frontage Modifications. Project was last reviewed May 14, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:02 p.m.

Present: Shaun Lynch, Applicant; and Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner, City of Santa

Barbara

<u>Staff comments:</u> Ms. Bedard requested a focus of Board comments on the neighborhood compatibility of the overall site design, the site grading, and tree removal prior to the project's review at the Planning Commission. Comments regarding traffic on Cota Street, etc. will be addressed at the Planning Commission. Topics such as window locations, architecture, design, etc., the subdivision as a whole, and the individual proposed lots will be addressed when the project returns for further SFDB design review.

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m.

Correspondence of concerns from Bob Gheno was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:31 p.m.

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission for return to the Full Board with comments:

- 1. The size, bulk, and scale of the proposed dwelling units are appropriate.
- 2. The concept landscape study is acceptable.
- 3. The character and style of the homes are appropriate to the surrounding developed neighborhood.
- 4. The driveway entry and tree preservation on the project site are appropriate, and the four trees proposed for removal are acceptable since 12 additional new trees are planned for replacement.
- 5. The Board requests the Planning Commission and applicant discuss the Diana Road exit that requires particular traffic scrutiny and requests the applicant to de-emphasize the use of that portion of the road.
- 6. The site is appropriate for the proposed type of development.
- 7. The Board finds the proposed density suitable, and the design development for the proposed area will not cause any substantial environmental damage, nor will it cause or pose any danger to fish or wildlife in the area.
- 8. The proposed grading is appropriate and sensitive to the surrounding neighborhood.
- 9. When the project returns for further design review, the Board will continue review of the project's Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

2. 1150 HARBOR HILLS DR RS-15 Zone

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-313-002

Application Number: MST2016-00363
Owner: Avo Semerdjian
Architect: Blackbird Architects

(Proposal for 412 square feet of one-story additions to the existing 1,967 square foot one-story single-family residence, and existing 460 square foot attached garage. The project includes exterior window and door changes and reframing a portion of the roof. Also proposed is related landscape and hardscape improvements. The proposed total of 2,865 square feet on a 21,504 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 61% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Review After Final is requested for a revised roof material. Project was last reviewed May 21, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:52 p.m.

Present: Ken Radtkey and Ray Twyford, Architects, Blackbird Architects; and Avo

Semerdjian, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with comments:

1. The proposed standing metal seam roof at a 12-inch measurement at center is acceptable since the Board understands that dust accumulates on the roof and serves to mitigate reflection impacts.

2. The proposed 9-inch measurement for the hips and ribs component is

acceptable.

Action: Ziegler/Miller, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 1563 SYCAMORE CANYON RD RS-1A Zone

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-320-010

Application Number: MST2017-00439
Owner: Bill Cottingham

(Proposal to construct a new 1,081 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 464 square foot two-car garage on a currently vacant lot. Other site improvements include minor landscaping and site paving. The proposed total of 1,545 square feet of development on a 23,654 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 33% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area-ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed January 22, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:08 p.m.

Present: Tim Drawney, Designer and Builder; and Bill Cottingham, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:20 p.m.

Wayne Goldwyn requested confirmation of the hedge length and dimension on the project site.

Public comment closed at 4:22 p.m.

Motion: Continue to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Consent with comments:

- 1. The main body of the garage door is to be of a solid material, with possibly a single panel of translucent material.
- The Board finds the proposed corner of the garage within the tentative 35-foot interior setback is aesthetically appropriate. The proposed corner of the garage does not pose consistency issues with SFDB Design Guidelines or City Ordinances.
- 3. The rather high single-story 10-foot, 6-inch first floor plate height is supportable and should not pose any negative impacts.

Action: Ferrell/Ziegler, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

4. 1025 E COTA ST R-2 Zone

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-185-014

Application Number: MST2017-00841
Owner: Riad Bahhur
Architect: David Burke

(Proposal to construct a new 1,236 square foot two-story single residential unit, with a 448 square foot attached two-car garage on a vacant lot. A 600 square foot, attached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) is also proposed; per state legislation (AB 2299 and SB 1069), the ADU is exempt from Design Review and the FAR calculation. Other site improvements include new landscaping and 281 square feet of patio areas. Approximately 143 cubic yards of import/export will occur on site. The proposed total of 1,684 square feet of development on a 5,000 square foot lot is 69% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed March 19, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:30 p.m.

Present: David Burke, Architect, Burke Design

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1. The Board finds the proposed 76% maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) acceptable.
- 2. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's appropriate size, bulk, and scale of the project are for its location and neighborhood, consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility;

quality of architecture and materials; and compliance with good neighborhood

guidelines.

Action: Ferrell/Miller, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 2620 SAMARKAND DR RS-7.5/USS Zone

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-310-031

Application Number: MST2017-00761
Owner: Joseph Leonard
Architect: John Beauchamp

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,125 square foot, one-story single residential unit with an attached 221 square foot one-car garage. The proposed project includes an interior remodel, a garage addition of 219 square feet, a first-floor addition of 558 square feet, and a second-story addition of 650 square feet. Other site improvements include a new 755 square foot roof deck, 170 square feet of covered outdoor area, new fencing, and a new 24' x 12' swimming pool with spa and a deck. Approximately 50 cubic yards of grading will occur on site. The proposed total 2,773 square feet of development on an 11,092 square foot lot is 72% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third Concept Review. Project was last reviewed April 30, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:41 p.m.

Present: John Beauchamp, Architect; and Joseph Leonard, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:47 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1. The Board appreciates the changes to the elevations and finds them acceptable.
- 2. Reduce the rear master deck to be 15-feet from the southern property line.
- 3. Raise sill of the master bathroom window facing the north side of the property to a more acceptable minimal 4-foot, 6-inch height.

Action: Miller/Ziegler, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:02 TO 5:07 P.M. *

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

6. 945 ARBOLADO RD RS-15 Zone

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-241-004

Application Number: MST2018-00144
Owner: Edward Glassgold
Applicant: Chris Cottrell

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 2,540 square foot two-level single residential unit with an existing 387 square foot two-car carport. The proposed project includes 250 square feet of additions to the upper level and 564 square feet of additions to the lower level. Other site improvements include a new covered entry porch, an interior remodel, approximately 1,118 square feet of new decks and converting the existing two-car carport to a two-car garage. The proposed total of 3,745 square feet of development on a 15,811 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District is 86% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Project was last reviewed April 16, 2018.)

Actual time: 5:07 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin and Chris Cottrell, Architects; and Erin Carroll, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 5:25 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

- 1. John McCann, neighbor, spoke of concerns regarding large massing, and the proposed masking of the project that impacts the preservation of neighboring private views. He requested story poles be placed on-site for the Board members and concerned neighbors.
- 2. Janet McCann, neighbor, spoke of concerns regarding the large massing, existing "tree-like" hedges, and the proposed pool and drainage impacts for neighboring homes.
- 3. Tom Fogel, adjacent neighbor, appreciates the previous revision of the roofline; however, spoke of concerns regarding foliage hedge height, private view impacts, and southeasterly privacy impacts.

Public comment closed at 5:35 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1. The Board appreciates the changes to the north elevation and the change-out of the garage door material and design.
- 2. Restudy the size of the two front windows identified at Items A and L on plan Sheet A.20.
- 3. On the south elevation, the Board will allow the two deck areas off the second and bottom floors to be located within the 15-foot guideline setback in this particular case from the observation of the common driveway to the west.
- 4. The staircase on the east side on the south elevation does not present an overwhelming impact to the view lines within the property or the adjacent neighbor, but the Board reserves the right to revisit this decision from review of the proposed site foliage.
- 5. The Board does not support a standing seam metal roof as not conducive to the Rivera area as seen from a major portion of the Santa Barbara area.

- 6. The Board recognizes that there may be some conditions and review requirements for the proposed retaining walls in the front yard.
- 7. The proposed general concept landscape plan is acceptable; however, the Board would encourage a replacement tree for the Morten Bay Fig tree proposed to be removed in or near the southwest deck area, and to restudy the ficus to be removed near the easterly property line at the northwest corner of the proposed garage enclosure.
- 8. The Board recognizes the Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) documents and finds them generally acceptable.
- 9. The Board finds the proposed 86% maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) acceptable, and recognizes the proposed FAR is 1% over the maximum allowed 85% FAR; however, the Board finds proposed FAR is still within the acceptable range conducive to the neighborhood.
- 10. Provide more information or a different exterior lighting wall sconce on plan Sheet A.20 for exterior lighting.
- 11. Provide an exterior lighting plan, specifically for both landscaping and exterior deck areas.
- 12. Staff to arrange a scheduled site visit for the Board.

Action:

Sweeney/Ferrell, 2/2/0. (Miller and Ziegler opposed, James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion failed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1. The plate height at the main level shall be 9-feet high.
- 2. The Board appreciates the changes to the north elevation and the change-out of the garage door material and design.
- 3. Restudy the size of the two front windows identified at Items A and L on plan Sheet A.20.
- 4. On the south elevation, the Board will allow the two deck areas off the second and bottom floors to be located within the 15-foot guideline setback in this particular case from the observation of the common driveway to the west.
- 5. The staircase on the east side on the south elevation does not present an overwhelming impact to the view lines within the property or the adjacent neighbor, but the Board reserves the right to revisit this decision from review of the proposed site foliage.
- 6. The Board does not support a standing seam metal roof as not conducive to the Rivera area as seen from a major portion of the Santa Barbara area.
- 7. The Board recognizes that there may be some conditions and review requirements for the proposed retaining walls in the front yard.
- 8. The proposed general concept landscape plan is acceptable; however, the Board would encourage a replacement tree for the Morten Bay Fig tree proposed to be removed in or near the southwest deck area, and to restudy the ficus to be removed near the easterly property line at the northwest corner of the proposed garage enclosure.
- 9. The Board recognizes the Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) documents and finds them generally acceptable.
- 10. The Board finds the proposed 86% maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) acceptable, and recognizes the proposed FAR is 1% over the maximum allowed 85% FAR; however, the Board finds proposed FAR is still within the acceptable range conducive to the neighborhood.

- 11. Provide more information or a different exterior lighting wall sconce on plan Sheet A.20 for exterior lighting.
- 12. Provide an exterior lighting plan, specifically for both landscaping and exterior deck areas.
- 13. Staff to arrange a scheduled site visit for the Board.

Action:

Miller/Ferrell, 3/1/0. (Ziegler opposed. James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:08 TO 6:38 P.M. *

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

7. 2901 PASEO TRANQUILLO RS-7.5 Zone

(6:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-203-008
Application Number: MST2017-00568

Owner: Gooch Retirement Plan Trust

Applicant: Amy Von Protz
Designer: Jessie Davis

(Proposal to construct 2,033 square feet of first- and second-floor additions to an existing 877 square foot one-story, single-family residence with a 364 square foot one-car garage. The proposed project also includes demolishing the existing one-car garage and constructing a new 498 square foot attached two-car garage. Other site improvements include an interior remodel and an attached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU); per state legislation (AB 2299 and SB 1069), the ADU is exempt from Design Review and the FAR calculation. The proposed total of 3,408 square feet of development on a 9,672 square foot lot is 95% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). A Minor Zoning Exception is requested to allow window alterations within the required interior setback that will be less than 5' from the interior property line.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Project was last reviewed October 2, 2017.)

Actual time: 6:38 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Applicant; Jessie Davis, Designer; and Jamie Pierce, Landscape

Architect

Public comment opened at 649 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

- 1. Timothy Follett had some concerns regarding some aspects of the project, but appreciates the reduced 82% FAR.
- 2. Correspondence in opposition from Jennifer Keane was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:51 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1. The Board supports the proposed design of the project.
- 2. The reduction of the plate heights, and the proposed size, bulk, and scale are acceptable.
- 3. The landscape plan is acceptable
- 4. The reduced floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) is acceptable.

- 5. Change the clerestory window configuration on the west elevation from Plaza Descanso where the closet doors are located.
- 6. The Boards supports the Minor Zoning Exception of the westside window in the setback.

Action: Miller/Ferrell, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

<u>Individual comments:</u> Chair Sweeney encouraged the applicant to advise the owner to maintain the existing hedge height for neighborhood compatibility.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 1803 ROBBINS ST RS-6 Zone

(6:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-142-010
Application Number: MST2018-00225

Owner: Noah Levit
Applicant: Harold Powell

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 842 square foot one-story single residential unit with a detached 313 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes a first-floor addition of 64 square feet and a new 306 square foot second-story addition. Other site improvements include an interior remodel and a new 180 square foot deck at the rear of the residence. The proposed total of 1,525 square feet of development on a 5,625 square foot lot is 59% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 7:04 p.m.

Present: Harold Powell, Applicant

Public comment opened at 7:12 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1. Study reconfiguring the dormer.
- 2. Change to siding the stucco around the lower window on the second story level.
- 3. The Board makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance in size, bulk, and scale; neighborhood compatibility; quality of architecture and materials; and compliance with good neighborhood guidelines; and preservation of public views.
- 4. Provide Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.
- 5. Provide rain gutters and barrels on the plans.

Action: Ferrell/Ziegler, 4/0/0. (James, Moticha, Richards absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.